

**N4 Collooney to Castlebaldwin  
Oral Hearing**

**Compulsory Purchase Order**

**and**

**Environmental Impact Statement  
Oral Hearing**

**Brief of Evidence**

**Archaeology, Architecture and Cultural Heritage**

**Eoin Halpin  
of  
Archaeological Development Services Ltd**

# **N4 Collooney to Castlebaldwin Oral Hearing**

## **Brief of Evidence by Eoin Halpin**

### **Table of Contents**

#### **Contents**

<b>1.0 INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>2.0 METHODOLOGY</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>3.0 RECEIVING ENVIRONMENT</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>4.0 PREDICTED IMPACTS</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>5.0 MITIGATION MEASURES AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>6.0 RESIDUAL IMPACTS</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>7.0 RESPONSE TO SUBMISSIONS</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>8.0 SUMMARY/CONCLUSION</b> .....	<b>8</b>

## 1.0 INTRODUCTION

Name: Eoin Halpin

Position: Company Director – Archaeological Development Services Ltd

Qualifications: I hold an honours degree (B.A.) in Archaeology and History of Art from University College Dublin. I am ex chairman and currently full member of the Institute of Archaeologists of Ireland. I am also a full member of the Institute for Archaeologists, the representative body for archaeology in the UK.

Experience: I have over 30 years of experience in archaeology gained both in Ireland and abroad, and since 1998 I am Director of Archaeological Development Services Ltd, and archaeological consultancy with offices in Dublin, Kells and Belfast.

I have read the archaeological assessment and reports associated with the proposed road development, and I have visited the project area to familiarize myself with the landscape and the nature of the archaeological and architectural sites and impacts being proposed.

## 2.0 METHODOLOGY

My role in the preparation of the EIS involved oversight of Chapter 15, “Archaeology, Architecture and Cultural Heritage”. This work was commissioned after a Route Selection Process that considered alternative route corridors for the road development was carried out.

The aim of Chapter 15 was to identify all Cultural Heritage sites that may be impacted by the proposed road development, assess the impacts and present mitigation strategies in order to minimise potential impacts. The methodology employed to complete this chapter was twofold, and comprised a desktop study and a field survey of sites within the vicinity of the proposed road development. This area of assessment was agreed upon with the Department of Arts, Heritage and the Gaeltacht (DAHG) and is in line with National Road Authority (NRA) guidelines.

The desktop section of the report was compiled using the following sources:

- the Records of Monuments and Places (RMP) of the Archaeological Survey of Ireland;
- the topographical files of the National Museum of Ireland;
- the Excavations Bulletin;
- the National Inventory of Architectural Heritage (NIAH) database,
- the Record of Protected Structures;
- aerial photographs;
- historic maps;
- place names and
- historic books and journals.

Field inspection involved field-walking the length of the route within a 200m-wide corridor, which expanded to accommodate all junctions. The aim of the field inspections was three-fold:

- to examine known sites within the study area;
- to determine the existence of previously unknown/designated sites and areas of archaeological potential through topographical evidence; and
- to highlight any architectural structures.

Photographs were also taken of the surrounding landscape and waterways along the route. Field inspections were undertaken in 2009. Six additional inspections were conducted, December 2011, November 2012, May 2013, June 2013, February 2014 and April 2014 to include proposed revisions to localised sections of the route and revisits to areas previously inaccessible due to adverse weather or ground conditions.

### **3.0 RECEIVING ENVIRONMENT**

There are a total of 101 Cultural Heritage Constraints (CHC's) in proximity to the Proposed Road Development. The CHCs consist of the following site types:

- Townland boundaries (22 no.);
- Protected structures (no. 2);
- 19th /early 20th century structures (21 no.);
- Sites of 19th century structures (16 no.);
- Wetland Areas of Archaeological Potential (13 no.);
- Early routeways (3 no.);
- Possible enclosure sites (3 no.);
- Old field boundaries (4 no.);
- A demesne (no. 1);
- 19th century gates (no. 4);
- A culvert (no. 1) and
- A roadside memorial (no. 1), to be relocated

A National Monument and nine other RMP sites are located in proximity to the Proposed Road Development and the Spoil Repository Areas. The National Monument is a 17th-century fortified house at Castlebaldwin that is also listed on the RMP and NIAH. A second National Monument, Carrowkeel Passage tomb cemetery, was included in the assessment, but has not being assigned a CHC number. The cemetery is located high up on the Bricklieve Mountains 2.5 kilometres distant from the Proposed Road Development.

The RMP sites include a potential ecclesiastical site, a complex of holy wells and seven ring forts.

In addition the route of the Miners Way and Historical Trail, part of the larger O'Sullivan – Beara Way crosses the line of the Proposed Road Development north of Castlebaldwin.

#### **4.0 PREDICTED IMPACTS**

There will be a direct impact on only one known archaeological monument, the plough-truncated potential enclosure site in Toberbride Townland (CHC 4/SL026-164).

There will be a moderate indirect impact on the ringfort in Cloghoge Upper (SL034-191/CHC 100), due to the re-alignment, slightly closer to the monument, of a proposed access road and an indirect visual impact on the recorded monument ring forts in Castlebaldwin (SL034-181/CHC 93), (SL034-184/CHC 98), in that the Proposed Road Development encroaches on their immediate environs.

The indirect impacts on the possible ecclesiastical site in Toberbride (SL026-026/CHC 2), the ringfort in Cloonamahan (SL026-77/CHC 23) and the ringfort (SL034-112/CHC 75) in Tawnagh at the northern end of the Proposed Road Development are considered imperceptible to slight.

There will be no direct impact on the three adjacent holy wells in Cloghoge Upper (SL034-186-001; -002;-003/CHC 96) at the southern end of the Proposed Road Development just south of Castlebaldwin.

It is predicted that the Proposed Road Development will have a slight visual impact on two National Monuments, Castlebaldwin Castle (CHC 99/ Nat. Mon. No. 373) and Carrowkeel Passage tomb cemetery (Nat. Mon. No. 318).

There will be a direct impact on a short section of the Miners Way and Historical Trail as it passes to the north of Castlebaldwin.

The proposed route will not directly impact on any Protected Structures (RPS) or structures listed on the NIAH.

#### **5.0 MITIGATION MEASURES AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

In accordance with the Code of Practice (2000) between the NRA and the Minister of the DAHG, every effort has been made to avoid direct impacts on archaeological or architectural heritage features. No National Monuments or protected buildings will be directly impacted by the proposed route.

One recorded archaeological monument, the plough-truncated possible enclosure at Toberbride (CHC 4) will be directly impacted upon by the Proposed Road Development. Geophysical survey and targeted test trenching will be undertaken here, and if deposits or features are confirmed during archaeological test trenching at these sites, it is proposed that they be preserved by record in agreement with the DAHG.

Previously unknown possible enclosures were identified during the course of the assessment in Doorly (CHC 35), Tawnagh (CHC 72) and Cloonymeenaghan (CHC 77) townlands. If archaeological deposits or features are confirmed during archaeological test trenching at any of these sites, it is proposed that they be preserved by record in agreement with the DAHG.

Mitigation measures for the remaining CHC sites, which will be impacted upon by the development, both at pre-construction and construction phases, shall be undertaken as directed by the Minister of the DAHG in compliance with national policy guidelines and statutory provisions for the protection of the archaeological and cultural heritage. It is proposed that the following measures be undertaken as a minimum.

**Targeted archaeological test excavations** shall be carried out at some 57 locations, which are deemed to have archaeological potential.

**Building surveys** including photography, shall be carried out on 14 structures, that are being directly impacted on by the Proposed Road Development.

**Townland Boundary Surveys** shall be carried out on 24 sections of townland boundaries, that are being traversed by the Proposed Road Development.

**Wade surveys** shall be carried out on 11 sections of watercourses, that are being directly impacted on by the Proposed Road Development.

**Geophysical survey** shall be employed, initially in three potential archaeological sites, in advance of test excavations, specifically the potential enclosure sites at Doorly (CHC 35) and Tawnagh (CHC 72) noted from aerial photographs and another potential enclosure at Cloonmeenaghan (CHC 77) noted during the field inspection and also, where possible, in other areas along the proposed route so as to inform the test trenching strategy.

**Screen planting.** It is proposed that the carefully designed hedgerow and feature planting alongside the junction and embankments in Castlebaldwin as outlined in the Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment Chapter (10) of this EIS, should substantially lessen any visual impact of the Proposed Road Development from the Carrowkeel Passage Tomb cemetery and from the 17th century fortified house at Castlebaldwin. It is noted that the existing N4 is visible from both monuments already.

In addition to the targeted site specific test trenching proposed, a general testing strategy will be applied to all lands required for the Proposed Road Development.

All archaeological features or finds and architectural and cultural heritage revealed will be mitigated prior to or during the construction of the Proposed Road Development in agreement with the National Monuments Section and the NRA Project Archaeologist.

The archaeological test trenching shall entail mechanical excavation of a 2m-wide trench along the centre-line of the proposed route with regular offset trenches to the edge of the land to comprise a testing sample of a minimum of 12% of the dry-land take and 10% of the wet-land take. This is to be organised by and carried out in the presence of suitably qualified archaeologists and carried out under Ministerial Directions. During test excavations, upon discovery of any archaeological features or horizons the topsoil will be removed to the level of any archaeological features, if present which will then be sampled to determine their nature, character, depth and extent; otherwise the trenches shall be excavated to the depth of subsoil.

Subsequent mitigation will involve either preservation in situ or preservation by record through full archaeological excavation. All mitigation practices will be carried out in accordance with current best practice and under Ministerial Directions.

All proposed heritage mitigation will be carried out at the earliest opportunity, in advance of road construction, so as to ensure an adequate amount of time for the excavation or preservation in situ of any archaeological features that may be identified by the testing. All mitigation shall be carried out under Ministerial Directions.

Strategies for the possibility of preservation in situ of archaeological remains will be considered on a case-by-case basis, in consultation with the Statutory Authority. Preservation in situ will be undertaken through avoidance of the confirmed feature in the development process, if possible, or preservation of the confirmed feature through detailed design, for example blanketed under road embankment.

## **6.0 RESIDUAL IMPACTS**

There will be no residual impacts on the Archaeological, Architectural and Cultural Heritage resource in and within the immediate vicinity of the proposed road development.

## **7.0 RESPONSE TO SUBMISSIONS**

In relation to a submission by Charles and Mary Cooper, Markree Castle Ltd and Patricia Cooper the Gate Lodge was assessed as part of the EIS. The Gate Lodge retains its function, the entrance still exists which will exit onto a local road as opposed to a National Primary road. A number of unsuccessful attempts were made by ADS to meet with the owners on site to discuss their concerns

The Gate Lodge is on the National Inventory of Architectural Heritage (NIAH Ref No 32402612) and listed on the Record of Protected Structures for Co Sligo (Ref No .298).

The route of the proposed road development was chosen so as to reduce as far as was possible, any adverse impacts on the demesne and its associated structures. As compilers of the Cultural Heritage section of the EIS, we were fully aware of the proximity of the demesne and more specifically the Gate Lodge, noting it in the EIS as a building on the Record of Protected Structures for Co Sligo and a building in the National Inventory of Architectural Heritage. The building was referred to in Volume 2, chapter 15 and listed in the appendices in Volume 4,

In accordance with standard practice in NRA projects, and as stated in the EIS 'All upstanding pre-1950 buildings within 50m from the edge of the proposed road take were given a cultural heritage constraint (CHC) number' (Vol 2 p15-429). As the Gate Lodge was located beyond this 50m, it was not given a CHC number and was therefore not the subject of a specific impact assessment. It is generally deemed that any impacts on CHC sites, beyond 50m from the CPO line, are indirect and slight to imperceptible.

Following the Cooper submission, impacts on the Gate Lodge were re-assessed.

The Gate Lodge lies to the NNE of the present line NW-SE running line of the N4.



Plate 1. Gate Lodge (NIAH 32402612) from the SW.

The NIAH records the structure as consisting of a detached multi-bay single-storey stone structure (Plate 1), which was built in 1832 to the designs of the English architect Francis Goodwin. The NIAH considers that the Gate Lodge is a gothic tour de force and is, they record, undoubtedly one of the more impressive Irish gate lodges, giving it a rating of 'national' importance.

The gate lodge sits in an elevated position overlooking the route of the present N4 running to the SSW. A narrow hedge-lined laneway links the gate lodge to the N4 down which the road can be glimpsed (Plates 2, 3 and 4). Views of the N4 are also intermittently visible to the NW and SW through the mature field boundaries and hedge rows which lie between the gate lodge and the road.



Plate 2. View from Gate Lodge down the access lane to the line of the present N4

It is proposed to improve the present line of the N4 as it passes the foot of the access lane to the lodge, part of the scheme in this area involves the addition of a secondary road running parallel to the eastern side of the N4, this will reduce the distance some 30m from the gate lodge to the new N4. In addition, there is the proposal to construct an attenuation area in the fields to the south of the lane way leading to the gate lodge. The CPO line encompassing this attenuation area will cross the gate lodge access lane some 100m from the lodge.

The visual impact specialists consider that while the new scheme 'will feature more prominently in the front garden views from (the gate lodge), visual impacts from this location are not considered higher than Slight Adverse.



Plate 3. View NE from present N4



Plate 4. View NE from proposed N4

As far as Cultural Heritage is concerned, there will be no direct impacts the gate lodge.

It is considered that there will be slight indirect adverse impacts in terms of setting and visual impacts, which are moderately significant due to the 'National' rating given by the NIAH to the Gate Lodge. However it is considered that these impacts will be appropriately mitigated by existing vegetation cover and the proposed extensive replacement planting along the surviving length of the access road and additional planting around the perimeter of the attenuation area.

It is noteworthy that in 2006 as part of a planning application to carry out renovation works on the Gate Lodge, the owners stated their intention to clear this vegetation in front of the gate lodge to make the building far more visible to motorists passing along the N4.

## **8.0 SUMMARY/CONCLUSION**

The submissions made relating to archaeological issues associated with the N4 Collooney to Castlebaldwin road scheme have highlighted a number of points for which there is appropriate mitigation that will be carried out as part of the approved scheme.

There will be a direct impact on only one known archaeological monument, the plough-truncated potential enclosure site in Toberbride Townland, with moderate indirect impacts on a further three sites and slight or imperceptible indirect impacts on three more.

It is predicted that the Proposed Road Development will have a slight visual impact on two National Monuments, Castlebaldwin Castle (CHC 99/ Nat. Mon. No. 373) and Carrowkeel Passage tomb cemetery (Nat. Mon. No. 318).

The route of the Miners Way & Historical Trail, part of the O'Sullivan Beara Way will be facilitated as it crosses the line of the proposed road development.

The proposed route will not directly impact on any Protected Structures (RPS) or structures listed on the NIAH.

Mitigation measures for all the Cultural Heritage Constraint sites which will be impacted upon by the development, both at pre-construction and construction phases, including those mentioned above, shall be undertaken as directed by the Minister of the DAHG in compliance with National Policy guidelines, relevant Codes of Practice and statutory provisions for the protection of the archaeological and cultural heritage.

These measures are designed to deal appropriately with both known and unknown cultural heritage sites which may be impacted upon by the development.